

## MEETING MINUTES

### MASSACHUSETTS HISTORICAL COMMISSION

February 13, 2019

Chairman Rosenberry called the meeting to order at 1:14 pm. On behalf of Secretary Galvin, he welcomed the Commissioners. Chairman Rosenberry next addressed the audience, thanking them for attending. For those individuals who may not have attended commission meetings in the past, Chairman Rosenberry explained the structure of the meeting and when in the process the public could address the commission.

The Chairman turned to the first item on the agenda, **the approval of the December 12, 2019 meeting minutes**. He called for a MOTION TO ACCEPT the minutes. A MOTION was made by Commissioner McDowell and SECONDED by Commissioner Friary. Hearing no questions, the chair moved the motion. The motion CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Chair Rosenberry then turned to the next item on the agenda, the Local Historic District Preliminary Study Report, first calling for any recusals. Hearing none, he turned the meeting over to Director of Local Government Programs, Chris Skelly.

Mr. Skelly presented the study report and distributed a copy of the presentation slides. A copy of the slides is on file with these minutes. He began with the Local Historic District Preliminary Study Report for the **Tarkiln Historic District** in Duxbury. This is a proposed single-building local historic district located at 245 Summer Street. The Tarkiln School was constructed circa 1871. From the National Register nomination, the Tarkiln School is a single-story, wood-frame, clapboarded Greek Revival building with Italianate details, in the Tarkiln neighborhood. The second parallel portion, a close copy of the original, was erected north of the original building in 1908. The two separate buildings were joined on their east end with a hyphen, completed in 1926, with a further eastern kitchen extension added in 1951.

The Tarkiln School ceased being a schoolhouse about 1950. In 1951, the facilities reopened as the Tarkiln Youth Center, a community center for rural western Duxbury. The Community Preservation Committee and the Duxbury Historical Commission approached town meeting for funds in 2004 to restore the building, which served an estimated 400 users a week. With the rehabilitation complete, it remains in town use today as a community center and recreational center, surrounded by ballfields and recreational facilities. It was listed on the National Register in 2009. It remains owned by the town. The study committee worked with the Duxbury town manager to propose this single building local historic district.

Mr. Skelly then presented the **Bradford Local Historic District Expansion** in Duxbury. This is a single building expansion to the existing local historic district. The Enoch Freeman house, located at 900 Tremont Street, reportedly predates the Revolutionary War. However, additional investigation would be needed to verify its construction date. In the early 20<sup>th</sup> century, it was known as the Old Orchard Cottage and Tearoom and operated as a summer season restaurant.

By the 1960s, the building had been converted back to residential use. It is considered a well-preserved Cape with few alterations.

Mr. Skelly then presented the **King Caesar Local Historic District Expansion** in Duxbury. This is a one property expansion to an existing local historic district. The current King Caesar Local Historic District includes only a Federal mansion built in 1809 for Ezra Weston II, often called “King Caesar” for his worldwide preeminence as a shipbuilder and merchant. The property was purchased by the Duxbury Rural and Historical Society in 1965, and was listed in the National Register of Historic Places in 1978. According to the study report, 247 King Caesar Road was built in 1904. It is one of about 7 grand homes still on King Caesar Road. There is no MHC inventory form for this property, and it is not listed in the National Register. Some nearby properties not protected by a local historic district include the 1911 Clairborn D. Garret House at 256 King Caesar Rd, and the 1920 John L. Magee House at 225 King Caesar Rd.

Mr Skelly then presented the **Powder Point Local Historic District Expansion** in Duxbury. Two properties are proposed for this expansion. The Isaac Chandler House is set within other contributing properties of the Old Shipbuilder’s National Register District. It was built by Isaac Chandler, a carpenter in 1809. It was listed on the National Register in 1986. 281 Powder Point Avenue is a modest residential building constructed in 1937 located down a dirt road. As the property is not currently visible from any public way, Mr. Skelly stated that he contacted the study committee for additional information on why this property was included in the local historic district study report. He has not received a reply.

Mr. Skelly then presented the **Winsor Local Historic District Expansion** in Duxbury. There are two buildings proposed for inclusion in this district. The Edgar Reed House, at 397 Washington Street, was constructed in 1900 as Duxbury transitioned from shipbuilding to a summer resort community. This dwelling was part of a marine laboratory complex on Duxbury Bay associated with Battelle Memorial Institute, a worldwide nonprofit research and development organization. It was included on the National Register as part of the Old Shipbuilder's Historic District in 1986. Next door at 405 Washington Street is the Nathaniel Winsor House, constructed in 1800. Winsor was a prominent shipbuilder in Duxbury, and this dwelling is one of at least ten houses extant on Washington Street and Winsor Street built for members of the Winsor family of shipbuilders. The dwelling is also part of the laboratory complex associated with Battelle Memorial Institute. It was also listed in the National Register as part of the Old Shipbuilder's Historic District in 1986.

Following the summary of the five proposed Duxbury LHDs, Mr. Skelly said that MHC staff recommends acknowledging receipt of the Duxbury Local Historic District Preliminary Study Report and providing the following advisory recommendations and comments:

The Massachusetts Historical Commission encourages the town of Duxbury to establish the Tarkiln Historic District.

The Massachusetts Historical Commission encourages the town of Duxbury to expand the Bradford Local Historic District, King Caesar Local Historic District, Powder Point Local Historic District and Winsor Local Historic District.

The Massachusetts Historical Commission encourages the study committee to include additional information within the Methodology and Significance sections of the final local historic district study report.

The Massachusetts Historical Commission encourages the study committee to investigate protecting additional significant historic resources through larger districts or additional local historic districts.

The chair called for a MOTION to acknowledge receipt of the Preliminary Study Report and accept the staff recommendations and comments. The chairman called for any questions or comments from the commission.

The chair recognized Commissioner Friary who said the recommendations should be more specific regarding what is missing, and that there are specific questions that need to be answered.

Commissioner Field agreed with Commissioner Friary on this issue. Commissioner Field noted in particular the property that was stated as not being visible from the road, and questioned why it was included in a local historic district. Commissioner Field said he would not be comfortable recommending that property for a local historic district.

Commissioner Cosco said that in the MHC document, Establishing Local Historic Districts, it states that the Massachusetts Historical Commission will review the report for completeness. If the report is found incomplete, the report will not be accepted by the MHC. Commissioner Cosco asked MHC staff if the report was considered complete.

Mr. Skelly replied that a review of the report found that it met the minimum level of completeness. It is technically a preliminary study report so additional information can be included in the final study report.

Commissioner McDowell said that he was OK with the recommendations as presented and that MHC staff can follow up with an additional letter detailing what is missing.

The chairman called for any other questions or comments from the commission. Hearing none, he asked for a MOTION to accept the recommendations as presented. A MOTION was made by Commissioner McDowell. A SECOND was not made. The MOTION failed.

The chair recognized Commissioner Friary who made a motion to notify the Town of Duxbury that the motion failed and that additional information is required. Commissioner Pride asked if it would be possible to consider the properties in question separately. The chair said he thought that was possible, but that there was a motion on the floor pending a second. The motion was SECONDED by Commissioner Crissman. The chair then asked for questions or comments. Commissioner Levy asked if it would be possible to break up the proposed districts and district expansions and vote on them separately. Mr. Skelly responded that he thought that would be fine. The chair then moved Commissioner Friary's motion. The MOTION failed with with Commissioners McDowell, Pride, and Crowley in favor, and six nays from Commissioners Cosco, Levy, Kleespies, Field, Friary, and Crissman.

The chairman then said he would entertain other suggestions for motions. The chair recognized Commissioner Levy who made a MOTION to vote on the Duxbury historic districts and historic district expansions separately. The Motion was SECONDED by Commissioner Kleespies. The chairman called for any questions or comments from the commission. The chair recognized Commissioner Fields who asked for clarification of Commission Friary's comment about two separate issues on two properties. He understood the Powder Point property not being visible from the street, but what was the other issue? Commissioner Friary responded that his other concern was the house for which no basic information has been submitted in the King Caesar expansion. Hearing no further questions, the chair moved the motion. The motion CARRIED.

The chair called for a MOTION to acknowledge receipt of the Preliminary Study Report for the **Tarkiln School Historic District** in the **Town Duxbury**, and to provide the advisory staff recommendations and comments. A MOTION was made by Commissioner Levy and SECONDED by Commissioner Pride. The chairman called for any questions or comments from the commission. Commissioner Cosco asked why Commission Friary was opposed to individual votes. Commissioner Friary stated that he felt that the whole report should be sent back to the Duxbury body to give us more information. The chair then moved the motion, which CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

The chair then called for a MOTION to acknowledge receipt of the Preliminary Study Report for the **Bradford Local Historic District Expansion** in the **Town Duxbury**, and to provide the advisory recommendations and comments. A MOTION was made by Commissioner Field and SECONDED by Commissioner Kleespies. The chairman called for any questions or comments from the commission. Hearing none, he moved the motion. The motion CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

The chair then called for a MOTION to acknowledge receipt of the Preliminary Study Report for the **Winsor Local Historic District Expansion** in the Town of Duxbury, and to provide the advisory recommendations and comments. A MOTION was made by Commissioner Field and SECONDED by Commissioner Pride. The chairman called for any questions or comments from the commission. Hearing none, he moved the motion. The motion CARRIED.

The chair called for a MOTION to acknowledge receipt of the Preliminary Study Report for the **Powder Point Local Historic District Expansion** in the Town of Duxbury, and to provide the advisory recommendations and comments. There was no MOTION to accept the staff recommendation regarding the Powder Point Local Historic District Expansion.

The chair then called for a MOTION to acknowledge receipt of the Preliminary Study Report for the **King Caesar Local Historic District Expansion in the Town of Duxbury**, and to provide the advisory recommendations and comments. There was no MOTION to accept the staff recommendation for the King Caesar Local Historic District Expansion.

The chair called for a motion to instruct MHC staff to reach out to the study committee seeking additional information regarding the Powder Point Local Historic District and King Caesar Local

Historic District expansions. A motion was made by Kleespies. Seconded by Commissioner Field. The **MOTION CARRIED**.

Chairman Rosenberry turned to the next item on the agenda, the presentation of the **FY17 Survey and Planning Grants Highlights** (no vote required), and turned the floor over to Michael Steinitz, Director, Preservation Planning Division. Mr. Steinitz reviewed the Survey and Planning Grant process, explaining that cities and towns across the Commonwealth compete annually for MHC's Survey and Planning grants. The matching grants (50 percent from MHC) facilitate the hiring of qualified professional consultants to undertake priority projects.

Mr. Steinitz then reviewed a PowerPoint presentation summarizing the highlights of the results of the eighteen FY17 projects, noting in particular at the outset that the survey projects added new or substantially updated documentation on over 2300 historic properties and sites. The FY17 projects included survey projects in Arlington, the Roxbury neighborhood of Boston, Aspinwall Hill in Brookline, Everett, Framingham, Hanover, Hanson, Hopkinton, Lynnfield, the Shipyard district in Marblehead, North Adams, Sturbridge, West Newbury, and Winchester. Additional projects included an archaeological reconnaissance survey and National Register district nomination for the 1500 acre Dogtown area of Gloucester and Rockport, the development of a communitywide preservation plan for the Town of Lenox, and staff support for a preservation planner in the City of Salem.

Chairman Rosenberry turned to the next item on the agenda, **Preview of March National Register nominations** (no vote required) The Chairman then recognized Director of the National Register Program, Betsy Friedberg. Ms. Friedberg informed the commissioners that there would be seven nominations for consideration at the March 13 meeting, including: Nathan Warnick Apartments at 57 Bicknell in Boston; in Brockton, the New England Telephone and Telegraph Engineering Office; in Duxbury, Cove Street Historic District; in South Hadley, South Hadley Congregational Church; in Springfield, The St. James Apartments and The Wigglesworth Apartments; and the Jonathan Keyes House, Westford. Ms. Friedberg said that commissioners would receive the nomination packets in the next couple of weeks.

The Chairman turned to the next item on the agenda, the **Executive Director's Report**. He then turned the floor over to Brona Simon, Executive Director.

Ms. Simon began by updating the commissioners on the state and federal budgets for MHC. The state budget process for state fiscal year 2020, which starts July 1<sup>st</sup>, has begun. She noted that the governor has sent his budget recommendations to the Legislature and he has recommended a one percent increase for MHC's operating budget. Regarding the federal budget, the continuing resolution that funds the Department of Interior will expire this Friday. The National Park Service is back at work and they have not yet completed their review of MHC's end of year report. This means that MHC has still not been authorized to prepare our annual work program, which once that's approved by the National Park Service would make MHC eligible to apply for our share of the Historic Preservation Fund for this fiscal year. The latest word about the amount of funding in the Historic Preservation Fund for SHPO offices is that it will either be at level funding or a very slight increase. We will know more once the budget agreement becomes public and is analyzed by the National Park Service and the National Conference of SHPOs. Luckily,

we are able to remain open whenever there is a federal government shutdown because of our state funding and carry-forward amounts.

Ms. Simon next reported that the 2019 Preservation Award nominations are due on Tuesday, February 19. The commission will vote on the selection of Preservation Awards at the April meeting.

Ms. Simon then reported that MPPF grant applications are due on March 22, noting that several workshops have been conducted by MHC's grants division staff.

Ms. Simon then noted that prior to next month's meeting, March 13, the Survey and Planning Grant Subcommittee (Commissioners DeWitt, Friary, and McDowell) will meet at 11 a.m. to review the survey and planning grant applications. The subcommittee will report their recommendations to the full Commission for votes that day. Ms. Simon acknowledged the hard work of the subcommittee, which allows for voting of the full commission based on their recommendations.

In personnel news, Ms. Simon announced the hiring of a new GIS Data Entry Intern, Jocelyn Lee, who comes to us as a grad student in archology from UMASS Boston.

Finally, Ms. Simon announced that September 20, 2019, will be the statewide historic preservation conference that Preservation Mass is organizing. It will be held in Plymouth.

This completed the Executive Director's report.

Hearing no further discussion, Chair Rosenberry called for any new business. He recognized Commissioner Levy for her service as a Commissioner; today is her last commission meeting after many years of service. Chair Rosenberry thanked her and wished her well on behalf of Secretary Galvin. Commissioner Levy said that her experience has been delightful.

Chair Rosenberry called for a MOTION to adjourn. A MOTION was made by Commissioner Crissman and SECONDED by Commissioner Levy. The meeting adjourned at 2:36 pm.

#### Commissioners Present

John Rosenberry

Donald Friary

James Crissman

Anne Pride

Michael McDowell

Cyrus Field

Suanna Selby Crowley

Barbara Levy

Jonathan Cosco

Gavin Kleespies

Staff Present

Brona Simon

Betsy Friedberg

Nancy Maida

Chris Skelly

Michael Steinitz

Peter Stott

Paul Holtz

Erin Doherty

Shari Perry-Wallace

Robin Osten

Patrick Powers

Shirley Brown

A TRUE COPY ATTEST

Respectfully submitted,

Shirley Brown